Ohio’s Statewide Career-Technical Credit Transfer Framework

2016 NCPN
Concurrent Session: Thursday, 10.6.2016, 1:15p.m. – 2:00p.m.
Room 103
Presenter: Jamilah Tucker
Director, Career Technical Credit Transfer Initiatives
Ohio Department of Higher Education
Purpose of Today’s Presentation

What you can expect - Framework

• Ohio’s Challenge and Response
• Statewide Career-Technical Articulated Credit
• Process, Results and Key findings in Building Statewide Articulation
• Lessons learned and best practices
• What is next?
• Question and answer
Ohio: Ohio Department of Higher Education

- **ODHE Role:**
  - Cabinet-Level Agency to the Governor of the State of Ohio
  - Drive the state's economic advancement through the public universities and colleges (14 Universities, 23 Community Colleges)

- **Coordination:**
  - New Degree Program Approval
  - State-Funded Financial Aid
  - Policy
Ohio needs to increase the percentage of working age Ohioans with a postsecondary certificate or degree to 65% by 2025. In order to reach this goal, Ohio needs to mobilize to raise educational attainment for in-demand, living wage occupations for citizens in every region, of every race and of every background.

Articulation and Transfer Initiatives: Ohio (snapshot/today)

- Ohio Transfer Module – General Education Transfer
- Transfer Assurance Guides guide statewide course level articulations for beginning and pre-major courses / College Credit Plus – Ohio’s Dual Enrollment***
- Career Technical Transfer Assurance Guides – guide statewide course level articulations for CTE students (Adult and Secondary)
- Military Transfer Assurance Guides – recognizes military experience with college credit
- One Year Option – Adult 900+ Clock Hour Program to ATS Degree
- Ohio Mathematics Initiative (structured degree programs, co-requisites, and redesign of gateway courses)
- AP/IB/CLEP/PLA – recognition of prior learning and awarded credit
- Guided Pathways (two-plus-two)

Average Annual Transfer Savings: $78 Million
CCP: $110 Million in FY 16
Articulation and Transfer In Ohio – History

• GOAL: Build a comprehensive credit transfer system among Ohio’s Public institution
• 1990 – 1st Statewide Articulation – Ohio Transfer Module (General Education Block Transfer)
• 1991 – Ohio Launched Tech Prep designed advanced standing articulation for “some” CTE students
• 2005 – Statewide Career-Technical Credit Transfer (ORC 3333.162)
• Beginning in 2011 and By 2013 – ODE “all” CTE programs will be “Tech Prep” / Secondary Career Technical Alignment Initiative
Ohio’s Credit Options for Career-Technical Students

AP
Bilateral Articulation
CCP
CTAGs
Articulation In the State of Ohio
Creating Statewide Agreements In Ohio

- Handout / Process Explained
Result

- Inventory of over 140 individual course-level statewide articulation agreements for secondary students.
Where Can I Find CTAGs that Are Available to the State

- Home » Educators » Credit Transfer » Career-Technical Credit Transfer (CT)²

- Information included at this site:
  - All CTAG Documents
  - All Alignment Guides
  - Date of Release
  - Affirmation Form Directly Linked Below (Notes as Needed)
CTAG Chart

- Home » Educators » Credit Transfer » Career-Technical Credit Transfer (CT)² » SCTAI

New SCTAI CTAGs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Technical Area</th>
<th>CTAN</th>
<th>ODE Course #</th>
<th>Review Requirements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Air Transportation</td>
<td>CTAIR001</td>
<td>177020</td>
<td>Full Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CTAIR002</td>
<td>177014</td>
<td>Full Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aviation Meteorology</td>
<td>CTAIR003</td>
<td>177019</td>
<td>Certificate of Affirmation Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aviation Industry</td>
<td>CTAIR004</td>
<td>177013</td>
<td>Full Review</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SECONDARY Submission Model

1. Program Accreditation or Charter
2. Full Course Review by Panel/Program Approval
3. Upfront Course Alignment ODE + ODHE/Affirmation

- Card "Carrying"/Credential/Certification/License
- Verification Form & Card "Carrying"/Credential/Certification/License
- Verification Form & Passing Grade of "C" in the Course on HS Transcript
- Verification Form, passing grade of "C" in course & Passing Score on end-of-course exam
- Letter Grade of "C" or Better in the Approved Course
- Passing Score on applicable end-of-course exam

*Secondary programs must be reviewed through secondary course review. Statewide standards, secondary end-of-course exams, and state testing outcomes are required. Institutions must align the course to the course of the same name at the higher-level institution.
The Transfer to Degree Guarantee helps career and technical students transfer credits to community college or four-year degree programs.

Visit these pages to learn how your credits can transfer:
- College and University Credit
- High School Advanced Placement Credit
- Military Credit
- Career-Technical Credit

Use our simple four-step process to see if your credits transfer. In order to view the applicable credit hours for your Career-Technical courses, check out the “Just the Facts” PDF available on this page.

**STEP 1**
* What was your program?
  - Select All-

**STEP 2**
* What school district did you attend?
  - Select All-

**STEP 3**
When did you take the program?
  - Select All-

**STEP 4**
What college will you attend?
  - Select All-

* Required value

SEARCH
FY16 Studies: Articulation in Ohio

- Opportunity for post-secondary education (PSE) institutions to review baseline data on CTE Articulation Students
- Opportunity for PSE Leadership, Registrars, and Institutional Researches to dialog with ODHE from an informed, data-driven standpoint on the progress and needs of the CTE and CTAG population.
Institution: Sinclair Community College

- Sinclair Community College, Southwestern Ohio
  - Last year’s HEI student enrollment (HC): 33,408
  - Large/Urban/Multi-Campus
  - Serving: Montgomery, Warren, and surrounding counties
  - IPEDS degree completion rate (150% time to complete): 17%
Research Question: How are CTAG students performing relative to a group of similar students at Sinclair?

- Performance was assessed with GPA, course completion, credit and credential attainment, and subsequent enrollment.
- The similar group of students were selected using *propensity score matching*, which is a process where we identify a set of characteristics in our CTAG population and then assemble a comparison group that is similar across those factors.
  - Matching variables: gender, age, total credits, Pell eligibility, minority/non-minority.
Results: Sinclair Community College

• About our CTAG students:
  - 322 students earned CTAG credits in 1,027 courses
  - IT and Automotive courses were the most popular
  - After earning CTAG credit and taking Sinclair Courses in the following year, 77.6% of the college courses they took resulted in a passing grade.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Popular CTAG courses:</th>
<th>Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A+ Operating Systems Troubleshooting</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction to Software Applications</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Network Fundamentals</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enterprise Desktop Support Technician</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction to Operating Systems</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A+ Certification IT Technician</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAD Concepts using AutoCAD</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CTAG Students Grades</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grade</td>
<td>Count</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>585</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>554</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>311</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2,201</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CTAG Student V. Comparison Group - GPA

CTAG GPA = 2.76
Control GPA = 2.50
## CTAG Student V. Comparison Group: Accumulation of Credit Hours

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Threshold</th>
<th>CTAG Students</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Passed Threshold</td>
<td>Students</td>
<td>Percent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Hours</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>42.26%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>57.54%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24 Hours</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>181</td>
<td>68.30%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>31.70%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 Hours</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>238</td>
<td>89.81%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>10.19%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Threshold</th>
<th>Control Students</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Passed Threshold</td>
<td>Students</td>
<td>Percent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Hours</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>36.98%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>63.02%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24 Hours</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>58.11%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>41.89%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36 Hours</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>83.02%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>16.98%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results and Key Findings (CTAG earners vs. comparison group)

- CTAG students tended to have a higher first semester GPA
- CTAG students come to Sinclair more ready for college level coursework
- CTAG students were much more likely to maintain satisfactory academic progress
- CTAG students completed credit hour thresholds (12/24/36 hours) more slowly
- Subsequent enrollment patterns, second semester GPA, and rates of credential attainment were not markedly different among CTAG students and the comparison group.
Institution: The Ohio State University

• The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio
  ▪ Enrollment (Autumn 2015): 45,289 (Columbus Campus) and 6,521 (Regional Campuses and ATI)
  ▪ Large/Urban/Multi-Campus/Public Research Institution
  ▪ Regional Campuses: Mansfield, Marion, Newark, and Wooster (ATI)
Purpose of the Study:

This study was conducted to determine the number of career-technical students receiving transfer credit at The Ohio State University (OSU) for coursework taken at an Ohio public secondary or adult career-technical institution. Researchers also investigated the type of credit awarded, and investigate best practices going forward.
Results: The Ohio State University

- About our CTAG students:
  - 222 total CTAG credits were awarded to 66 students between 2013 and 2015 for an average of 3.31 credits per student.
  - 2013, 2014, 2015 Cohorts: Of those only 2 students have graduated so far, both this past spring 2016 term.

**Student Cohorts (HC)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CTAN Popularity:**
- CTIT – Information Technology
- CTED – Education (Introduction to Education)

**However:**

The Most Popular Major of CTAN Students: Engineering
Results Continued: The Ohio State University

2013-2015 Cohorts Students by Campus

Top 5 CTAG Feeder Institutions 2013-2015
### Results: CTAN Student Cohorts Average GPA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COHORTS</th>
<th>2013</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of Students</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined/Averaged GPA</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>3.07</td>
<td>3.02</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: 5 students throughout the three cohorts dropped out.
Results, Key Findings, and Future Research

- Future research might provide comparison of cohorts against native, first time students.
- Extraction of data was labor intensive.
- OSU Process Improvements:
  - Set up a “CTAG” student group in our student system
  - Screen appropriate transcripts using specific information
  - Career-Technical Transcripts will now route directly to the Imaging Center and will have a uniform tag of “CTAG.”
  - Career-Technical transcripts will now flow through OnBase, the University’s document imaging system. This process will give us consistency when querying documents if necessary.
- The Student Group in SIS comment section will capture feeder HS
Institution: Cuyahoga Community College

- Cuyahoga Community College, Northeast Ohio
  - Enrollment: 55,000 credit and non-credit students annually
  - Urban/Multi-Campus/Large
  - Serving: Cuyahoga County and surrounding communities
  - Degree completion rate: 9.3%

- Study Research Questions
  - Since May 2012 how many students have been awarded CTAG credit?
  - Which Career Technical schools are the main feeder schools?
  - What were the CTAG students’ first and second term GPAs?
  - How many CTAG students have completed a degree or certificate?
  - Which degrees/certificates were most frequently awarded to CTAG students?
Results: Cuyahoga Community College

- About our CTAG credit earning students:
  - 109 students have earned CTAG credit since May 2012
  - 1,205 credits have been awarded across 15 subject areas
  - Top three feeder schools- Parma City Schools (27%), Polaris Career Center (20%), Cuyahoga Valley Career Center (20%)

- Results and key findings:
  - 72% enrolled in a major related to the CTAG subject area
  - Average GPAs after CTAG award
    - 1st Term GPA 2.70 (Institutional Average 2.40)
    - 2nd Term GPA 2.93 (Institutional Average 2.51)
  - 26% of CTAG awardees completed one or more degrees/certificates (Institutional grad rate 9.3%)
Results Continued: Cuyahoga Community College

- Limitations:
  - Within the past year, 42 additional students were not awarded due to one or more reasons:
    - Students had not applied to the college
    - High school transcript had not been submitted
    - Required certificates of completion had not been included
    - Verification form was incomplete or incorrectly completed
- Lessons Learned:
  - Enhanced communication procedures with our partner Career-Technical Schools and students
  - Improved outreach to students
    - CTAG inclusion in publication, “Ways You Can Earn College Credit Prior to Attending”
Example of The Publication

CAREER-TECHNICAL CREDIT TRANSFER

CAREER-TECHNICAL ASSURANCE GUIDES - O H I O R E V I S E D C O D E 3 3 3 . 1 6 2
CTAG = Career Technical Assurance Guide (pathway/degree), CT2 = Career Technical Credit Transfer (process), CTAN = Career Technical Assurance Number (course number)

The Ohio Department of Higher Education (ODHE) and the Ohio Department of Education (ODE) collaborated to ensure students at secondary or adult career-technical institutions could transfer agreed-upon technical courses to Ohio’s public two- and four-year institutions that offer curriculum aligned to a CTAG (Non-credit to Credit).

Requires curriculum to be submitted by secondary Career Technical Education programs, Ohio Technical Center (Adult Ed) programs, and colleges/universities to ODHE. It must then be reviewed and approved by a panel of faculty experts from around the state.

Once a course/program is approved, students who complete the course/program and pass all requirements including any credentialing or licensing exam(s) are eligible for college credit at any of Ohio’s public colleges or universities that offer the course/program.

Grades do not transfer - credit does. Credit will only be posted to the student’s record/transcript after the student has applied and is enrolled in classes at Tri-C.

There is no cost to the student, the school/OTC or the college/university for CTAG credit.

TO RECEIVE CREDIT AT TRI-C, A STUDENT MUST:

- Apply for admission and enroll at Tri-C.
- Successfully complete the program/courses and all assessments, as required.
- Fill out Part I of the Verification Form and submit it to the career-technical institution from which they graduated (verification Form can be found at www.ohiohighered.org/transfer/ct2/how-to-access-ct2-credit).
- Have the career-technical institution complete Parts II and III and send the completed form to Cuyahoga Community College Office of the Registrar
  PO Box 5996
  Cleveland, OH 44101

Students cannot hand carry this document to the College! In some cases the career-technical institution or student must provide end-of-program assessment scores (e.g., Intro to Education Portfolio Score, IT exams or OCTCA/WEAO2Am).

Meet with the Tri-C counselor and bring all relevant certificates, licenses or credentials with them to this meeting.

For more information, contact Becky Barnes at 216-987-3028 or becky.barnes@tri-c.edu.
Summary

• CTE articulation students tended to persist at greater rates among multiple campus studies
• Results are mixed in term of GPA comparison groups, but still positive
• CTAG articulation use is on the rise at most campuses, with FY16 yielding more numbers of students

Best Practices

• Increase college going rates of CTE students
• Improve student understanding and advising on CTAG process
• Data: tracking/disaggregated alternative credit tables = improved institutional analysis
Next Steps for Statewide Articulation

- Finalize All Course-Level Articulation Releases
- Video Modules to Communicate to Administrators and Students on the CTAG process.
- Investigation into data and transcription of articulated credit versus other types of credit
- Adoption/Full Implementation
- Professional Development
Content Contributors – Institutional PI’s

- Carl Brun, Ph.D, Assistant Vice President, Wright State University
- Mark Cubberley, Wright State University Lake Campus
- Chris Dorsten, Registrar, Tri-C
- Joanna Duvall, Director of MIS, Marion Technical College, duvallj@mtc.edu
- Mark Hicks, Student Records Functional Analyst, Lorain Community College
- Chad Atkinson, Ph.D, Manager of Research, Sinclair Community College
- Jim Lavery, Registrar, Marion Technical College, laveryj@mtc.edu
- Sun Jamerson, Associate Registrar, Lorain County Community College
- Roslyn Perry, Associate Registrar, The Ohio State University
- Jamilah Tucker, Director of Career Technical Transfer Initiatives, Department of Higher Education, jjones@highered.ohio.gov
contact me:

Jamilah Tucker, Director (CT)²
614-446-0543
jjones@highered.ohio.gov
Questions
THANK YOU